

Cornell University
Department of Economics

Econ 620

Instructor: Prof. Kiefer

Solution to Problem set # 3

1)

Recall that

$$\begin{aligned} e &= y - X\hat{\beta} = y - X(X'X)^{-1}X'y = [I - X(X'X)^{-1}X']y = My \\ &= M(X\beta + \varepsilon) = MX\beta + M\varepsilon = M\varepsilon \end{aligned}$$

Then,

$$E(e) = E(M\varepsilon) = ME(\varepsilon) = 0$$

since $M = [I - X(X'X)^{-1}X']$ is non-stochastic. Hence,

$$\begin{aligned} Var(e) &= E[(e - E(e))(e - E(e))'] = E[ee'] \\ &= E[M\varepsilon\varepsilon'M'] = ME[\varepsilon\varepsilon']M = \sigma^2MIM \\ &= \sigma^2M \end{aligned}$$

note that M is symmetric and idempotent. The variance matrix of e is an $(N \times N)$ matrix. The variance of e_j is the (j, j) element of the variance matrix, which can be picked up by

$$Var(e_j) = \sigma^2 M^{jj} = \sigma^2 [I - X(X'X)^{-1}X']^{jj} = \sigma^2 [1 - X_j(X'X)^{-1}X_j']$$

where X_j is the j th row of X and X_j' is the j th column of X' . Then,

$$\begin{aligned} Var(e_j) - \sigma^2 &= \sigma^2 [1 - X_j(X'X)^{-1}X_j'] - \sigma^2 \\ &= -\sigma^2 X_j(X'X)^{-1}X_j' \\ &= -\sigma^2 X_j(X'X)^{-1}X_j' \leq 0 \end{aligned}$$

since $X_j(X'X)^{-1}X_j'$ is a quadratic form in $(X'X)^{-1}$ and we know that $(X'X)$ is positive semidefinite and hence so is $(X'X)^{-1}$.

2)

What is the operator we use to get mean deviation form? Yes, it is $A = I - \mathbf{1}(\mathbf{1}'\mathbf{1})^{-1}\mathbf{1}'$. Then, the X matrix is now;

$$X = \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{1} & AX_2 \end{bmatrix}$$

where $\mathbf{1}$ is an $(N \times 1)$ vector of ones and X_2 is an $(N \times (k-1))$ matrix of independent variables except for the constant term. Therefore,

$$\begin{aligned} X'X &= \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{1}'\mathbf{1} & \mathbf{1}'AX_2 \\ X_2'A\mathbf{1} & X_2'AA'X_2 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} N & \mathbf{0} \\ \mathbf{0} & X_2'AX_2 \end{bmatrix} \\ X'y &= \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{1}'y \\ X_2'Ay \end{bmatrix} \end{aligned}$$

note that $\mathbf{1}'A = A\mathbf{1} = \mathbf{0}$ and again A is symmetric idempotent. Hence,

$$\begin{aligned} Var(\hat{\beta}) &= \sigma^2 (X'X)^{-1} = \sigma^2 \begin{bmatrix} N & \mathbf{0} \\ \mathbf{0} & X_2'AX_2 \end{bmatrix}^{-1} \\ &= \sigma^2 \begin{bmatrix} \frac{1}{N} & \mathbf{0} \\ \mathbf{0} & (X_2'AX_2)^{-1} \end{bmatrix} \end{aligned}$$

We use the fact that $(X'X)$ is block diagonal. The covariance between the intercept and the slope estimator is the off-diagonal term, which is $\mathbf{0}$.

3)

1. (a) Easy!

(b) First of all, note that

$$\begin{aligned} \hat{\beta}_2 &= (X_2'M_1X_2)^{-1} (X_2'M_1y) \\ &= (X_2'M_1X_2)^{-1} X_2'M_1 (X_1\beta_1 + X_2\beta_2 + \varepsilon) \\ &= (X_2'M_1X_2)^{-1} X_2'M_1X_2\beta_2 + (X_2'M_1X_2)^{-1} X_2'M_1\varepsilon \\ &= \beta_2 + (X_2'M_1X_2)^{-1} X_2'M_1\varepsilon \end{aligned}$$

where $M_1 = I - X_1(X_1'X_1)^{-1}X_1'$. The third equality come from the fact that $M_1X_1 = \mathbf{0}$. Then,

$$\begin{aligned} E(\hat{\beta}_2) &= \beta_2 + (X_2'M_1X_2)^{-1} X_2'M_1E(\varepsilon) \\ &= \beta_2 + (X_2'M_1X_2)^{-1} X_2'M_1X_1\gamma \\ &= \beta_2 \end{aligned}$$

again since $M_1X_1 = \mathbf{0}$.

4)

For X_n , it is obvious that

$$\text{plim} X_n = \text{plim} \left(3 - \frac{1}{n^2} \right) = 3 \quad (1)$$

On the other hand, by the central limit theorem,

$$\sqrt{n} (\bar{Z}_n - \mu) \xrightarrow{d} N(0, \sigma^2)$$

when $\bar{Z}_n = \frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=1}^n Z_i$ with $E(Z_i) = \mu$ and $\text{Var}(Z_i) = \sigma^2$. The CLT can also be expressed as

$$\frac{\sqrt{n} (\bar{Z}_n - \mu)}{\sigma} \xrightarrow{d} N(0, 1)$$

In our case, $E(Z_i) = 0$. Therefore,

$$Y_n = \frac{\sqrt{n} \bar{Z}_n}{\sigma} \xrightarrow{d} N(0, 1) \quad (2)$$

Moreover, recall the following theorems; If $X_n \xrightarrow{p} c$ and $Y_n \xrightarrow{d} Y$

$$(i) \quad X_n + Y_n \xrightarrow{d} c + Y$$

$$(ii) \quad X_n Y_n \xrightarrow{d} cY$$

$$(iii) \quad \text{If } Y_n \xrightarrow{d} Y \text{ and } g \text{ is continuous, } g(Y_n) \xrightarrow{d} g(Y)$$

(a) From (1) and (2) with (i), we have

$$X_n + Y_n \xrightarrow{d} 3 + Y$$

where $Y \sim N(0, 1)$. Then,

$$X_n + Y_n \xrightarrow{d} N(3, 1)$$

(b) From (1) and (2) with (ii), we have

$$X_n Y_n \xrightarrow{d} 3Y$$

where $Y \sim N(0, 1)$. Then,

$$X_n Y_n \xrightarrow{d} N(0, 9)$$

(c) From (2) and (iii),

$$Y_n^2 \xrightarrow{d} Y^2$$

where $Y \sim N(0, 1)$. Then,

$$Y_n^2 \xrightarrow{d} \chi^2(1)$$

5)

1. Model I;

$$y = \alpha_1 D_1 + \alpha_2 D_2 + \alpha_3 D_3 + \alpha_4 D_4 + \varepsilon$$

Data matrices are given by

$$y = \begin{bmatrix} y_1^1 \\ \dots \\ y_n^1 \\ y_1^2 \\ \dots \\ y_n^2 \\ y_1^3 \\ \dots \\ y_n^3 \\ y_1^4 \\ \dots \\ y_n^4 \end{bmatrix} \quad X = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ \dots & \dots & \dots & \dots \\ 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\ \dots & \dots & \dots & \dots \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ \dots & \dots & \dots & \dots \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 \\ \dots & \dots & \dots & \dots \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix}$$

where y_i^j is the observation on the dependent variable in year i , quarter j .
Then,

$$\hat{\alpha} = (X'X)^{-1} X'y = \begin{bmatrix} n & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & n & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & n & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & n \end{bmatrix}^{-1} \begin{bmatrix} n\bar{y}^1 \\ n\bar{y}^2 \\ n\bar{y}^3 \\ n\bar{y}^4 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} \bar{y}^1 \\ \bar{y}^2 \\ \bar{y}^3 \\ \bar{y}^4 \end{bmatrix}$$

where \bar{y}^j is average value of the dependent variable in the j^{th} quarter.

Model II;

$$y = \alpha + \alpha_2 D_2 + \alpha_3 D_3 + \alpha_4 D_4 + \varepsilon$$

Data matrices are given by

$$y = \begin{bmatrix} y_1^1 \\ \dots \\ y_n^1 \\ y_1^2 \\ \dots \\ y_n^2 \\ y_1^3 \\ \dots \\ y_n^3 \\ y_1^4 \\ \dots \\ y_n^4 \end{bmatrix} \quad X = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ \dots & \dots & \dots & \dots \\ 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\ \dots & \dots & \dots & \dots \\ 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ \dots & \dots & \dots & \dots \\ 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 \\ \dots & \dots & \dots & \dots \\ 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix}$$

Then,

$$\hat{\alpha} = \begin{bmatrix} 4n & n & n & n \\ n & n & 0 & 0 \\ n & 0 & n & 0 \\ n & 0 & 0 & n \end{bmatrix}^{-1} \begin{bmatrix} n(\bar{y}^1 + \bar{y}^2 + \bar{y}^3 + \bar{y}^4) \\ n\bar{y}^2 \\ n\bar{y}^3 \\ n\bar{y}^4 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} \bar{y}^2 \\ \bar{y}^2 - \bar{y}^1 \\ \bar{y}^3 - \bar{y}^1 \\ \bar{y}^4 - \bar{y}^1 \end{bmatrix}$$

Suppose the model with other explanatory variable;

$$y = \alpha_1 D_1 + \alpha_2 D_2 + \alpha_3 D_3 + \alpha_4 D_4 + \beta x + \varepsilon = D\alpha + \beta x + \varepsilon$$

$$y = \alpha + \alpha_2 D_2 + \alpha_3 D_3 + \alpha_4 D_4 + \beta x + \varepsilon = D^* \alpha^* + \beta^* x + \varepsilon$$

Then,

$$\hat{\beta} = (x' M_D x)^{-1} (x' M_D y) \text{ and } \hat{\beta}^* = (x' M_{D^*} x)^{-1} (x' M_{D^*} y)$$

where $M_D = I - D(D'D)^{-1}D'$ and $M_{D^*} = I - D^*(D^{*'}D^*)^{-1}D^{*}$. Then,

$$D(D'D)^{-1}D' = \begin{bmatrix} \frac{1}{n}\mathbf{1}_n\mathbf{1}_n' & 0_{n \times n} & 0_{n \times n} & 0_{n \times n} \\ 0_{n \times n} & \frac{1}{n}\mathbf{1}_n\mathbf{1}_n' & 0_{n \times n} & 0_{n \times n} \\ 0_{n \times n} & 0_{n \times n} & \frac{1}{n}\mathbf{1}_n\mathbf{1}_n' & 0_{n \times n} \\ 0_{n \times n} & 0_{n \times n} & 0_{n \times n} & \frac{1}{n}\mathbf{1}_n\mathbf{1}_n' \end{bmatrix}$$

where $\mathbf{1}_n$ is an $(n \times 1)$ vector of ones and $0_{n \times n}$ is an $(n \times n)$ matrix of zeros. On the other hand

$$D^*(D^{*'}D^*)^{-1}D^{*'} = \begin{bmatrix} \frac{1}{n}\mathbf{1}_n\mathbf{1}_n' & 0_{n \times n} & 0_{n \times n} & 0_{n \times n} \\ 0_{n \times n} & \frac{1}{n}\mathbf{1}_n\mathbf{1}_n' & 0_{n \times n} & 0_{n \times n} \\ 0_{n \times n} & 0_{n \times n} & \frac{1}{n}\mathbf{1}_n\mathbf{1}_n' & 0_{n \times n} \\ 0_{n \times n} & 0_{n \times n} & 0_{n \times n} & \frac{1}{n}\mathbf{1}_n\mathbf{1}_n' \end{bmatrix}$$

Therefore, $\hat{\beta} = \hat{\beta}^*$.

What if we run the model;

$$y = \alpha + \alpha_1 D_1 + \alpha_2 D_2 + \alpha_3 D_3 + \alpha_4 D_4 + \varepsilon$$

The X matrix is given by

$$X = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ \dots & \dots & \dots & \dots & \dots \\ 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\ \dots & \dots & \dots & \dots & \dots \\ 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ \dots & \dots & \dots & \dots & \dots \\ 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 \\ \dots & \dots & \dots & \dots & \dots \\ 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix}$$

The first column is the sum of the other columns. The X matrix is not of the full column rank, which results in the singularity of $(X'X)$ matrix. -Dummy trap-

6)

1. We will be very careful in indicating which theorem we use in each step. We start from the definition of the least squares estimator;

$$\hat{\beta} = (X'X)^{-1} X'y = \beta + (X'X)^{-1} X'\varepsilon \quad (1)$$

(a) It is much easier to see what is going on if we express the matrix expression in terms of summation. After a thoughtful moment, you notice that it is given by

$$(X'X) = \sum_{i=1}^N x_i x_i'$$

where x_i is a $(k \times 1)$ vector corresponding to the i^{th} observation. From the condition given in the question

$$\text{plim} \frac{1}{N} X'X = Q$$

We can conclude that

$$\text{plim} \frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=1}^N x_i x_i' = Q$$

The matrix notation is exactly the condition;

$$\text{plim} \frac{X'X}{N} = Q \quad (2)$$

What about $(X'\varepsilon)$? – remember that $(X'\varepsilon)$ is a $(k \times 1)$ vector –. Again it is given by

$$\sum_{i=1}^N x_i \varepsilon_i$$

Let's scale the sum by N to get $\frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=1}^N x_i \varepsilon_i$. Note that

$$\frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=1}^N x_i \varepsilon_i = \frac{1}{N} (x_1 \varepsilon_1 + x_2 \varepsilon_2 + \cdots + x_N \varepsilon_N)$$

The term is the sample average of $x_i \varepsilon_i$, where $x_i \varepsilon_i$'s are uncorrelated random vectors with mean 0 and variance $\sigma^2 x_i x_i'$ since

$$E(x_i \varepsilon_i) = x_i E(\varepsilon_i) = 0 \text{ since } x_i \text{ is non-stochastic.}$$

$$\text{Var}(x_i \varepsilon_i) = E(x_i \varepsilon_i \varepsilon_i x_i') = x_i x_i' E(\varepsilon_i^2) = \sigma^2 x_i x_i'$$

$$\text{Cov}(x_i \varepsilon_i, x_t \varepsilon_t) = E[x_i \varepsilon_i \varepsilon_t x_t'] = x_i x_t' E(\varepsilon_i \varepsilon_t) = 0 \text{ since } i \neq t.$$

Note also that $\text{Var}(\frac{X'\varepsilon}{N}) = \frac{\sigma^2}{N} \frac{(X'X)}{N} \rightarrow 0Q = 0$. Then, from the Weak Law of Large Numbers(WLLN), we have

$$\frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=1}^N x_i \varepsilon_i \xrightarrow{p} \mathbf{0}$$

Then, in vector notation, we have

$$\frac{1}{N}X'\varepsilon \xrightarrow{p} \mathbf{0} \quad (3)$$

We will slightly reshape (1) to get;

$$\hat{\beta} = \beta + \left(\frac{X'X}{N} \right)^{-1} \frac{X'\varepsilon}{N}$$

Then,

$$\begin{aligned} \text{plim}\hat{\beta} &= \text{plim}\beta + \text{plim} \left(\frac{X'X}{N} \right)^{-1} \frac{X'\varepsilon}{N} \text{ by (b) in question 2} \\ &= \beta + \text{plim} \left(\frac{X'X}{N} \right)^{-1} \text{plim} \frac{X'\varepsilon}{N} \text{ by (a) in question 2} \\ &= \beta + \left(\text{plim} \frac{X'X}{N} \right)^{-1} \text{plim} \frac{X'\varepsilon}{N} \text{ by Slutsky's theorem} \\ &= \beta + Q^{-1}\mathbf{0} \text{ by (2) and (3) and } Q \text{ is invertible} \\ &= \beta \end{aligned}$$

i.e.

$$\hat{\beta} \xrightarrow{p} \beta$$

In words, the least squares estimator $\hat{\beta}$ is a consistent estimator for β .

(b) From (1), we have

$$\hat{\beta} - \beta = (X'X)^{-1} X'\varepsilon$$

Now, we want to scale slightly differently to invoke the Central Limit Theorem (CLT);

$$\sqrt{N}(\hat{\beta} - \beta) = \left(\frac{X'X}{N} \right)^{-1} \frac{X'\varepsilon}{\sqrt{N}} \quad (4)$$

We know that

$$\left(\frac{X'X}{N} \right)^{-1} \xrightarrow{p} Q^{-1} \quad (5)$$

from (2). Now let's take care of $\frac{X'\varepsilon}{\sqrt{N}}$. Again, $\frac{X'\varepsilon}{\sqrt{N}}$ is given by

$$\frac{1}{\sqrt{N}} \sum_{i=1}^N x_i \varepsilon_i = \frac{1}{\sqrt{N}} (x_1 \varepsilon_1 + x_2 \varepsilon_2 + \cdots + x_N \varepsilon_N)$$

As we've already seen in (a), $x_i \varepsilon_i$'s are uncorrelated random vectors with mean 0 and variance $\sigma^2 x_i x_i'$. Then, by CLT - here, we use a version of

CLT in Page 7 of the lecture note since we have different variances across observations-,

$$\left(\sum_{i=1}^N \sigma^2 x_i x_i' \right)^{\frac{1}{2}} \sum_{i=1}^N x_i \varepsilon_i \xrightarrow{d} N(\mathbf{0}, I) \quad (6)$$

where $\left(\sum_{i=1}^N \sigma^2 x_i x_i' \right)^{\frac{1}{2}}$ is a notation for Λ such that $\Lambda^2 = \sum_{i=1}^N \sigma^2 x_i x_i'$.

However, we know that

$$\frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=1}^N \sigma^2 x_i x_i' = \sigma^2 \frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=1}^N x_i x_i' \xrightarrow{p} \sigma^2 Q \quad (7)$$

from part (a). Hence,

$$\left(\frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=1}^N \sigma^2 x_i x_i' \right)^{\frac{1}{2}} \frac{1}{\sqrt{N}} \sum_{i=1}^N x_i \varepsilon_i \xrightarrow{d} N(\mathbf{0}, I)$$

becomes

$$\frac{1}{\sqrt{N}} \sum_{i=1}^N x_i \varepsilon_i \xrightarrow{d} N(0, \sigma^2 Q) \quad (8)$$

Then, from (5) and (8) with (b) in question (3), we have

$$\sqrt{N}(\hat{\beta} - \beta) = \left(\frac{X'X}{N} \right)^{-1} \frac{X'\varepsilon}{\sqrt{N}} \xrightarrow{d} N(\mathbf{0}, Q^{-1}QQ^{-1}) = N(\mathbf{0}, Q^{-1})$$

To appreciate the importance of this result, note that we have obtained asymptotic normality of $\hat{\beta}_{OLS}$ WITHOUT the assumption of normality of the error term!.

(c) Note that

$$\begin{aligned} s^2 &= \frac{e'e}{N-k} = \frac{\varepsilon' M \varepsilon}{N-k} \text{ since } e = M\varepsilon \\ &= \frac{\varepsilon' [I - X(X'X)^{-1}X'] \varepsilon}{N-k} = \frac{N}{N-k} \left[\frac{\varepsilon' \varepsilon}{N} - \frac{\varepsilon' X (X'X)^{-1} X' \varepsilon}{N} \right] \\ &= \frac{N}{N-k} \left[\frac{\varepsilon' \varepsilon}{N} - \frac{\varepsilon' X}{N} \left(\frac{X'X}{N} \right)^{-1} \frac{X' \varepsilon}{N} \right] \end{aligned}$$

Now,

$$\begin{aligned}
\text{plim}s^2 &= \text{plim} \frac{N}{N-k} \text{plim} \left[\frac{\varepsilon'\varepsilon}{N} - \frac{\varepsilon'X}{N} \left(\frac{X'X}{N} \right)^{-1} \frac{X'\varepsilon}{N} \right] \text{ by (a) in question2} \\
&= \text{plim} \frac{N}{N-k} \left[\text{plim} \frac{\varepsilon'\varepsilon}{N} - \text{plim} \frac{\varepsilon'X}{N} \left(\frac{X'X}{N} \right)^{-1} \text{plim} \frac{X'\varepsilon}{N} \right] \text{ by (b) in question2} \\
&= \text{plim} \frac{N}{N-k} \left[\text{plim} \frac{\varepsilon'\varepsilon}{N} - \text{plim} \frac{\varepsilon'X}{N} \text{plim} \left(\frac{X'X}{N} \right)^{-1} \text{plim} \frac{X'\varepsilon}{N} \right] \text{ by (a) in question2} \\
&= \text{plim} \frac{N}{N-k} \left[\text{plim} \frac{\varepsilon'\varepsilon}{N} - \text{plim} \frac{\varepsilon'X}{N} \left(\text{plim} \frac{X'X}{N} \right)^{-1} \text{plim} \frac{X'\varepsilon}{N} \right] \text{ by Slutsky's theorem} \\
&= [\sigma^2 - \mathbf{0}'Q^{-1}\mathbf{0}] = \sigma^2
\end{aligned}$$

since

$$\begin{aligned}
\text{plim}_{N \rightarrow \infty} \frac{N}{N-k} &= 1, \text{plim} \frac{X'\varepsilon}{N} = \mathbf{0} \text{ by (3)} \\
\left(\text{plim} \frac{X'X}{N} \right)^{-1} &= Q^{-1} \text{ by (5)}
\end{aligned}$$

and

$$\frac{\varepsilon'\varepsilon}{N} = \frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=1}^N \varepsilon_i^2$$

which is again an average of ε_i^2 's whose mean is $E(\varepsilon_i^2) = \sigma^2$. Here, if we assume that ε_i^2 's are independent, then we don't need to calculate the variance since we can use a version of WLLN in *Notes 3* on page 4 of the lecture note # 8, and therefore WLLN applies to this case. But otherwise, we need extra conditions on the ε_i^2 's, such as that they are uncorrelated and that for all i, $E(\varepsilon_i^4) = \phi < \infty$ (i.e., second moment of the ε_i^2 's exists). Then, by WLLN

$$\frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=1}^N \varepsilon_i^2 \xrightarrow{p} \sigma^2$$

Therefore,

$$\text{plim} \frac{\varepsilon'\varepsilon}{N} = \sigma^2$$